#### **Bimetric Gravity and Dark Matter**

#### **Angnis Schmidt-May**

Max-Planck-Institut für Physik



#### Invisibles Workshop Karlsruhe Institute of Technology, 06.09.18



# **Navigation**





The Ghost-Free Theory



Physics of Massive Spin-2 Fields



Cosmology



Summary



## Standard Model of Particle Physics & General Relativity

Spin 0: Higgs boson  $\phi$ 

Spin 1/2: leptons, quarks  $\psi^a$ 

Spin 1: gluons, photon, W- & Z-boson  $A_{\mu}$ 

Spin 2: graviton  $g_{\mu\nu}$ 

## Standard Model of Particle Physics & General Relativity

Spin 0: Higgs boson  $\phi$ 

Spin 1/2: leptons, quarks  $\psi^a$ 

Spin 1: gluons, photon, W- & Z-boson  $A_{\mu}$ 

Spin 2: graviton  $g_{\mu\nu}$ 

+ Supersymmetry

Spin 2:

## Standard Model of Particle Physics & General Relativity

Spin 0: Higgs boson  $\phi$ 

Spin 1/2: leptons, quarks  $\psi^a$ 

new models are usually built using more copies of these particles

Spin 1: gluons, photon, W- & Z-boson  $A_{\mu}$ 

graviton  $g_{\mu\nu}$  less understood...

Spin 2:

## Standard Model of Particle Physics & General Relativity

MASSLESS !

Spin 0: Higgs boson  $\phi$ 

Spin 1/2: leptons, quarks  $\psi^a$ 

Spin 1: gluons, photon, W- & Z-boson  $A_{\mu}$ 

graviton  $g_{\mu\nu}$ 

massless & massive

Spin 2:

## Standard Model of Particle Physics & General Relativity

Spin 0: Higgs boson  $\phi$ 

Spin 1/2: leptons, quarks  $\psi^a$ 

Spin 1: gluons, photon, W- & Z-boson  $A_{\mu}$ 

graviton  $g_{\mu\nu}$ 

just one field...

multiplets of

gauge groups



How do we make a spin-2 field massive ?

Can several spin-2 fields interact ?



#### **Massless** Theory

# General Relativity

= classical nonlinear field theory for metric tensor  $g_{\mu\nu}$ 

Einstein-Hilbert action: 
$$S_{\rm EH}[g] = M_{\rm P}^2 \int d^4x \sqrt{g} \left( R(g) - 2\Lambda \right)$$

Einstein's equations: 
$$R_{\mu\nu} - \frac{1}{2}g_{\mu\nu}R + \Lambda g_{\mu\nu} = 0$$



 describes the two degrees of freedom of a self-interacting, massless spin-2 particle

#### **Massless** Theory

# General Relativity

= classical nonlinear field theory for metric tensor  $g_{\mu\nu}$ 

Einstein-Hilbert action: 
$$S_{\rm EH}[g] = M_{\rm P}^2 \int d^4x \sqrt{g} \left( R(g) - 2\Lambda \right)$$
  
Einstein's equations:  $R_{\mu\nu} - \frac{1}{2}g_{\mu\nu}R + \Lambda g_{\mu\nu} = 0$   
two derivatives  
kinetic term

of a self-interacting, massless spin-2 particle



## **General Relativity**

# unique description of self-interacting massless spin-2 field

**Mass Term** ... should not contain derivatives nor loose indices. Examples: scalar (spin 0) vector (spin 1)  $-\partial_{\mu}\phi\partial^{\mu}\phi - m^2\phi^2$  $-F^{\mu\nu}F_{\mu\nu}-m^2A^{\mu}A_{\mu}$ 



For the spin-2 tensor contracting indices of the metric gives:  $g^{\mu\nu}g_{\mu\nu} = 4$ This is not a mass term. Mass Term... should not contain derivatives nor loose indices.Examples:scalar (spin 0)vector (spin 1) $-g^{\mu\nu}\partial_{\mu}\phi\partial_{\nu}\phi - m^{2}\phi^{2}$  $-g^{\mu\rho}g^{\nu\sigma}F_{\rho\sigma}F_{\mu\nu} - m^{2}g^{\mu\nu}A_{\mu}A_{\nu}$ 

For the spin-2 tensor contracting indices of the metric gives:  $g^{\mu\nu}g_{\mu\nu} = 4$ This is not a mass term.

Simplest way out: Introduce second "metric" to contract indices:

$$g^{\mu\nu}f_{\mu\nu} = \text{Tr}(g^{-1}f) \qquad f^{\mu\nu}g_{\mu\nu} = \text{Tr}(f^{-1}g)$$

Mass Term... should not contain derivatives nor loose indices.Examples:scalar (spin 0)vector (spin 1) $-g^{\mu\nu}\partial_{\mu}\phi\partial_{\nu}\phi - m^{2}\phi^{2}$  $-g^{\mu\rho}g^{\nu\sigma}F_{\rho\sigma}F_{\mu\nu} - m^{2}g^{\mu\nu}A_{\mu}A_{\nu}$ 

For the spin-2 tensor contracting indices of the metric gives:  $g^{\mu\nu}g_{\mu\nu} = 4$ This is not a mass term.

Simplest way out: Introduce second "metric" to contract indices:

$$g^{\mu\nu}f_{\mu\nu} = \operatorname{Tr}(g^{-1}f)$$
  $f^{\mu\nu}g_{\mu\nu} = \operatorname{Tr}(f^{-1}g)$   
Massive gravity action:  $S_{\mathrm{MG}}[g] = S_{\mathrm{EH}}[g] - \int d^4x \ V(g, f)$ 



#### **Bimetric Theory**

Nonlinear action for two interacting tensors:

$$S_{\rm b}[g,f] = m_g^2 \int \mathrm{d}^4 x \sqrt{g} \left( R(g) - 2\Lambda \right) + m_f^2 \int \mathrm{d}^4 x \sqrt{f} \left( R(f) - 2\tilde{\Lambda} \right) - \int \mathrm{d}^4 x \, V(g,f)$$



both metrics are dynamical and treated on equal footing



should describe massive & massless spin-2 field (5+2 d.o.f.)

#### **Bimetric Theory**

Nonlinear action for two interacting tensors:

$$S_{\rm b}[g,f] = m_g^2 \int \mathrm{d}^4 x \sqrt{g} \left( R(g) - 2\Lambda \right) + m_f^2 \int \mathrm{d}^4 x \sqrt{f} \left( R(f) - 2\tilde{\Lambda} \right) - \int \mathrm{d}^4 x \, V(g,f)$$



both metrics are dynamical and treated on equal footing



This looks good, but in general the theory has a ghost!







de Rham, Gabadadze, Tolley (2010); Hassan, Rosen (2011)

$$S_{b}[g,f] = m_{g}^{2} \int d^{4}x \sqrt{g} R(g)$$
  
+  $m_{f}^{2} \int d^{4}x \sqrt{f} R(f) - \int d^{4}x V(g,f)$ 

$$V(g,f) = m^4 \sqrt{g} \sum_{n=0}^4 \beta_n e_n \left( \sqrt{g^{-1}f} \right)$$

- $\gg$  3 interaction parameters  $\beta_n$
- $\Rightarrow$  square-root matrix S defined through  $S^2 = g^{-1}f$



de Rham, Gabadadze, Tolley (2010); Hassan, Rosen (2011)

$$S_{\rm b}[g,f] = m_g^2 \int \mathrm{d}^4 x \sqrt{g} R(g) + m_f^2 \int \mathrm{d}^4 x \sqrt{f} R(f) - \int \mathrm{d}^4 x V(g,f)$$

$$\int V(g,f) = m^4 \sqrt{g} \sum_{n=0}^4 \beta_n e_n \left( \sqrt{g^{-1}f} \right) = m^4 \sqrt{f} \sum_{n=0}^4 \beta_{4-n} e_n \left( \sqrt{f^{-1}g} \right)$$

elementary symmetric polynomials:

$$e_1(S) = \operatorname{Tr}[S] \qquad e_2(S) = \frac{1}{2} \left( (\operatorname{Tr}[S])^2 - \operatorname{Tr}[S^2] \right)$$
$$e_3(S) = \frac{1}{6} \left( (\operatorname{Tr}[S])^3 - 3 \operatorname{Tr}[S^2] \operatorname{Tr}[S] + 2 \operatorname{Tr}[S^3] \right)$$



#### Mass spectrum

☆ Maximally symmetric solutions:

$$ar{f}_{\mu
u}=c^2ar{g}_{\mu
u}$$
 with  $c={\sf const.}$ 

Hassan, ASM, von Strauss (2012)

☆ Perturbations around proportional backgrounds:

$$g_{\mu\nu} = \bar{g}_{\mu\nu} + \delta g_{\mu\nu} \qquad f_{\mu\nu} = c^2 \bar{g}_{\mu\nu} + \delta f_{\mu\nu}$$

☆ Can be diagonalised into mass eigenstates:

$$\delta G_{\mu\nu} \propto \delta g_{\mu\nu} + \alpha^2 \delta f_{\mu\nu}$$
 massless (2 d.o.f.)  
 $\delta M_{\mu\nu} \propto \delta f_{\mu\nu} - c^2 \delta g_{\mu\nu}$  massive (5 d.o.f.)

with Fierz-Pauli mass  $m_{\mathrm{FP}} = m_{\mathrm{FP}}(lpha, eta_n, c)$ 



## Ghost-free bimetric theory

# unique description of massless + massive spin-2 field



## What is the physical metric ?

How does matter couple to the tensor fields ?

## Matter Coupling

Yamashita, de Felice, Tanaka; de Rham, Heisenberg, Ribeiro (2015)

$$S_{b}[g,f] = m_{g}^{2} \int d^{4}x \sqrt{g} R(g) + m_{f}^{2} \int d^{4}x \sqrt{f} R(f) - \int d^{4}x V(g,f) + \int d^{4}x \sqrt{g} \mathcal{L}_{matter}(g,\phi)$$

Absence of ghosts: only one metric can couple to matter!  $\Rightarrow g_{\mu\nu}$  is gravitational metric

Baccetti, Martin-Moruno, Visser (2012); Hassan, ASM, von Strauss (2012/14); Akrami, Hassan, Koennig, ASM, Solomon (2015)

$$S_{\rm b}[g,f] = m_g^2 \int \mathrm{d}^4 x \sqrt{g} R(g) + m_f^2 \int \mathrm{d}^4 x \sqrt{f} R(f) - \int \mathrm{d}^4 x V(g,f) + \int \mathrm{d}^4 x \sqrt{g} \mathcal{L}_{\rm matter}(g,\phi)$$

#### (linearised) gravitational metric:

$$\delta g_{\mu
u} \propto \delta G_{\mu
u} - lpha^2 \delta M_{\mu
u} \qquad (lpha \equiv m_f/m_g) \ {
m massless} \ {
m massive}$$

Baccetti, Martin-Moruno, Visser (2012); Hassan, ASM, von Strauss (2012/14); Akrami, Hassan, Koennig, ASM, Solomon (2015)

$$S_{\rm b}[g,f] = m_g^2 \int \mathrm{d}^4 x \sqrt{g} R(g) + m_f^2 \int \mathrm{d}^4 x \sqrt{f} R(f) - \int \mathrm{d}^4 x V(g,f) + \int \mathrm{d}^4 x \sqrt{g} \mathcal{L}_{\rm matter}(g,\phi)$$

#### (linearised) gravitational metric:

$$\delta g_{\mu
u} \propto \delta G_{\mu
u} - lpha^2 \delta M_{\mu
u}$$
 ( $lpha \equiv m_f/m_g$ ) massless massive

The gravitational metric is not massless but a superposition of mass eigenstates. Max, Platscher, Smirnov (2017): analysis of gravitational wave oscillations

Baccetti, Martin-Moruno, Visser (2012); Hassan, ASM, von Strauss (2012/14); Akrami, Hassan, Koennig, ASM, Solomon (2015)

$$S_{\rm b}[g,f] = m_g^2 \int \mathrm{d}^4 x \sqrt{g} R(g) + m_f^2 \int \mathrm{d}^4 x \sqrt{f} R(f) - \int \mathrm{d}^4 x V(g,f) + \int \mathrm{d}^4 x \sqrt{g} \mathcal{L}_{\rm matter}(g,\phi)$$

#### (linearised) gravitational metric:

$$\delta g_{\mu
u} \propto \delta G_{\mu
u} - lpha^2 \delta M_{\mu
u}$$
 ( $lpha \equiv m_f/m_g$ ) massless massive

for small  $\alpha = m_f/m_g$  gravity is dominated by the massless mode the massive spin-2 field interacts only weakly with matter

Baccetti, Martin-Moruno, Visser (2012); Hassan, ASM, von Strauss (2012/14); Akrami, Hassan, Koennig, ASM, Solomon (2015)

$$S_{\rm b}[g,f] = m_g^2 \int \mathrm{d}^4 x \sqrt{g} R(g) + m_f^2 \int \mathrm{d}^4 x \sqrt{f} R(f) - \int \mathrm{d}^4 x V(g,f) + \int \mathrm{d}^4 x \sqrt{g} \mathcal{L}_{\rm matter}(g,\phi)$$

$$\alpha = m_f/m_g \to 0$$

is the General Relativity limit of bimetric theory

(when all other parameters are fixed, this makes the spin-2 mass  $m_{\rm FP}$  infinitely large)



## Ghost-free bimetric theory

# General Relativity + additional tensor field

## Structure of Vertices

#### (bimetric action expanded in mass eigenstates)

#### Quadratic (Fierz-Pauli)

$\delta G^2$	$\delta G \delta M$	$\delta M^2$
$1,\Lambda$	0	$1,\Lambda,m_{ m FP}^2$

#### what about higher orders?

$$\begin{split} S &= \frac{1}{2} \int \mathrm{d}^4 x \, \left[ \delta G_{\mu\nu} \mathcal{E}^{\mu\nu\rho\sigma} \delta G_{\rho\sigma} &+ \delta M_{\mu\nu} \mathcal{E}^{\mu\nu\rho\sigma} \delta M_{\rho\sigma} \right. \\ &\left. - \left. \frac{m_{\mathrm{FP}}^2}{2} \left( \delta M^{\mu\nu} \delta M_{\mu\nu} - \delta M^2 \right) \right] + \mathcal{O} \left( \frac{1}{m_{\mathrm{Pl}}} \right) \end{split}$$

## Structure of Vertices

#### Quadratic (Fierz-Pauli)

$\delta G^2$	$\delta G \delta M$	$\delta M^2$
$1,\Lambda$	0	$1,\Lambda,m_{ m FP}^2$

#### Cubic (suppressed by $m_{ m Pl}^{-1}$ )

$\delta G^3$	$\delta G^2 \delta M$	$\delta G \delta M^2$	$\delta M^3$
$1,\Lambda$	0	$1,\Lambda,m_{ m FP}^2$	$\begin{array}{l} \alpha,\alpha\Lambda,\alpha m_{\rm FP}^2 \\ \frac{1}{\alpha},\frac{1}{\alpha}\Lambda,\frac{1}{\alpha}m_{\rm FP}^2 \end{array}$

$$m_{\rm Pl} = m_g \sqrt{1 + \alpha^2}$$

Babichev, Marzola, Raidal, ASM,

Urban, Veermäe, von Strauss (2016)

## Structure of Vertices

#### Babichev, Marzola, Raidal, ASM, Urban, Veermäe, von Strauss (2016)

#### Quadratic (Fierz-Pauli)

$\delta G^2$	$\delta G \delta M$	$\delta M^2$
$1,\Lambda$	0	$1,\Lambda,m_{ m FP}^2$

### Cubic (suppressed by $m_{ m Pl}^{-1}$ )

$\delta G^3$	$\delta G^2 \delta M$	$\delta G \delta M^2$	$\delta M^3$
$1,\Lambda$	0	$1,\Lambda,m_{ m FP}^2$	$\begin{array}{l} \alpha,\alpha\Lambda,\alpha m_{\rm FP}^2 \\ \frac{1}{\alpha},\frac{1}{\alpha}\Lambda,\frac{1}{\alpha}m_{\rm FP}^2 \end{array}$



self-interactions of massless spin-2 sum up to General Relativity no vertices giving rise to decay of massive into massless spin-2



massive spin-2 particle gravitates like baryonic matter



self-interactions of massive spin-2 are enhanced in the GR limit





# The cosmological cake

A DEC



# The cosmological cake



#### 25% Dark Matter

70% Dark Energy

Viable cosmology with self-accelerating solutions

10/14

Akrami, Hassan, Könnig, ASM, Solomon (2015); Könnig, Patil, Amendola (2014); Akrami, Koivisto, Mota, Sandstad (2013); Volkov; von Strauss, ASM, Enander, Mörtsell, Hassan; Comelli, Crisostomi, Nesti, Pilo (2011) 5% normal matter



"partial masslessness"

Apolo, Hassan (2016) Hassan, von Strauss, ASM (2012/15) Deser, Waldron (2001)

> 70% Dark Energy

Viable cosmology with self-accelerating solutions

Akrami, Hassan, Könnig, ASM, Solomon (2015); Könnig, Patil, Amendola (2014); Akrami, Koivisto, Mota, Sandstad (2013); Volkov; von Strauss, ASM, Enander, Mörtsell, Hassan; Comelli, Crisostomi, Nesti, Pilo (2011)

25%

**Dark Matter** 

5% normal matter



Symmetries?

"partial masslessness"

Apolo, Hassan (2016) Hassan, von Strauss, ASM (2012/15) Deser, Waldron (2001)

> 70% Dark Energy

Viable cosmology with self-accelerating solutions

Akrami, Hassan, Könnig, ASM, Solomon (2015); Könnig, Patil, Amendola (2014); Akrami, Koivisto, Mota, Sandstad (2013); Volkov; von Strauss, ASM, Enander, Mörtsell, Hassan; Comelli, Crisostomi, Nesti, Pilo (2011)

25%

**Dark Matter** 

#### massive spin-2?

Babichev, Marzola, Raidal, ASM, Urban, Veermäe, von Strauss (2016); Aoki, Mukohyama (2016);

5% normal matter

10/14

#### Spin-2 Dark Matter

Babichev, Marzola, Raidal, ASM, Urban, Veermäe, von Strauss (2016)

Recall the (linearised) gravitational metric:  $\delta$ 

$$\delta g_{\mu
u} \propto \delta G_{\mu
u} - lpha^2 \delta M_{\mu
u}$$
massless massive

and the General Relativity limit of bimetric theory:  $\alpha = m_f/m_g 
ightarrow 0$ 

 $\Rightarrow$  gravity is weak because the physical Planck mass is large (  $m_{
m Pl}=m_g\sqrt{1+lpha^2}$  )



massive spin-2 field decouples from matter, interacts only with gravity



#### **Features**



heavy spin-2 field automatically resembles dark matter when gravity resembles general relativity

interactions with baryonic matter are suppressed by the Planck mass

spin-2 mass and interaction scale are on the order of a few TeV

#### **Features**



heavy spin-2 field automatically resembles dark matter when gravity resembles general relativity

interactions with baryonic matter are suppressed by the Planck mass

🛞 spin-2 mass and interaction scale are on the order of a few TeV

Chu & Garcia-Cely (2017): may be lowered to MeV by taking into account self-interactions of massive spin-2

Gonzalez, ASM, von Strauss (2017):

interesting new effects for more than one massive spin-2 field

#### Features



interactions with baryonic matter are suppressed by the Planck mass

🔅 spin-2 mass and interaction scale are on the order of a few TeV



no need for extra fields, artificial symmetries or fine tuning



bimetric theory could explain dark matter in the context of gravity



massive spin-2 field is a natural addition to the Standard Models



#### Massive spin-2 fields...

review: ASM, Mikael von Strauss; 1512.00021



🔅 provide one of the few known consistent modifications of GR



are uniquely described by ghost-free bimetric theory



could be a dark matter candidate whose coupling to baryonic matter is suppressed by the Planck scale



Larger theoretical framework: String Theory ? Additional symmetries ? Quantum gravity ?

Can we detect/observe the massive spin-2 ?







5 contraints on 10 components, equation propagates <u>5 degrees of freedom</u>



Trace equation contains two derivatives, not a constraint



#### **Proportional solutions**

Hassan, ASM, von Strauss (2012)

Ansatz: 
$$ar{f}_{\mu
u}=c^2ar{g}_{\mu
u}$$
 with  $c={\sf const.}$ 

$$R_{\mu\nu}(\bar{g}) - \frac{1}{2}\bar{g}_{\mu\nu}R(\bar{g}) + \Lambda_g(\alpha,\beta_n,c)\bar{g}_{\mu\nu} = 0$$
$$R_{\mu\nu}(\bar{g}) - \frac{1}{2}\bar{g}_{\mu\nu}R(\bar{g}) + \Lambda_f(\alpha,\beta_n,c)\bar{g}_{\mu\nu} = 0$$

so consistency condition:  $\Lambda_g(\alpha, \beta_n, c) = \Lambda_f(\alpha, \beta_n, c)$  determines c

> Maximally symmetric backgrounds with  $~R_{\mu
u}(ar{g})=\Lambda_gar{g}_{\mu
u}$ 







## **DM** Production

- standard freeze-out does not work: no thermal equilibrium, expansion rate always dominates over interaction rate
- gravitational production does not work: required DM mass is too large and violates perturbativity bound
- ☆ freeze-in mechanism works: gives lower bound on DM mass





#### **Higher-Derivative Action**

Hassan, ASM, von Strauss (2013); Gording & ASM (2018)

Equations for  $f_{\mu
u}$  can be solved perturbatively in  $lpha=m_f/m_g$ 

$$\Rightarrow \text{ Higher-derivative action for } g_{\mu\nu}:$$

$$S_{\text{eff}}[g] = \int d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left[ m_{\text{Pl}}^2 (R - 2\Lambda) + \frac{\alpha^4 c_{RR}}{m^2} \left( \frac{1}{3} R^2 - R^{\mu\nu} R_{\mu\nu} \right) \right] + \mathcal{O}(\alpha^6)$$
general relativity (Weyl tensor)<sup>2</sup> + total derivative

curvature corrections to GR capture effects of heavy spin-2 field

#### Hinterbichler & Rosen (2012)

#### Vierbein Formulation

$$g_{\mu\nu} = e^{a}_{\ \mu}\eta_{ab}e^{b}_{\ \nu} \qquad f_{\mu\nu} = \tilde{e}^{a}_{\ \mu}\eta_{ab}\tilde{e}^{b}_{\ \nu}$$

Einstein-Hilbert terms: 
$$S_{\rm EH} = m_g^2 \epsilon_{abcd} \int \left( R^{ab} - \Lambda e^a \wedge e^b \right) \wedge e^c \wedge e^d$$

interaction terms:

$$S_{\rm int} = -m^4 \epsilon_{abcd} \int \left[ \bar{\beta}_1 \ e^a \wedge e^b \wedge e^c \wedge \tilde{e}^d + \bar{\beta}_2 \ e^a \wedge e^b \wedge \tilde{e}^c \wedge \tilde{e}^d + \bar{\beta}_3 \ e^a \wedge \tilde{e}^b \wedge \tilde{e}^c \wedge \tilde{e}^d \right]$$

equivalent to bimetric theory and ghost-free only if  $e^a_{\ \mu}\eta_{ab}\tilde{e}^b_{\ \nu} = e^a_{\ \nu}\eta_{ab}\tilde{e}^b_{\ \mu}$ existence of square-root and intersection of light cones (Hassan & Kocic, 2017)
natural generalization to other spacetime dimensions



☆ used to be a (nondynamical) ● which has been integrated out